

DMS Notice QC - 08 - 5

July 31, 2008 Discard: Retain

TO WEIGHTS AND MEASURES OFFICIALS

SUBJECT: Safeway, Inc. Settlement

Attached is a stipulated final judgment and permanent injunction involving recent litigation against Safeway, Inc. for violations of the Business and Professions Code, and the Health and Safety Code. We are very pleased with the fine work done by the prosecution team and others representing the enforcement agencies.

The weights and measures lead prosecution counties should be sure to report these penalties in the County Monthly Report (CMR). According to the settlement Napa, Fresno, Marin, Sacramento, Santa Cruz, and Solano Counties should probably decide who will report the overall settlement information. All participating counties should record their individual investigative cost reimbursements in the appropriate columns in the report. There is currently no other way for the program to enter the settlement data into the monthly and annual activities.

Sincerely,

Edmund E. Williams

Director

Attachment

Cc: QC Special Investigators

Kevin Masuhara, Director, County Liaison Office

Ron Flores, Program Supervisor



ENDORSED

GARY LIEBERSTEIN District Attorney, County of Napa Daryl Roberts (SBN 111981) 3 Deputy District Attorney 931 Parkway Mall Napa, CA 94559 Tel: (707) 253-4211 5 (707) 299-4322 Pax:

JUN 1 0 2008 Clark of the Napa Superior Court

f, HUSS

6

Attorneys for Plaintiff

7 В

SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA

COUNTY OF NAPA

9 10

11

12

PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA.

Plaintiff.

26-42803

FINAL JUDGMENT and PERMANENT INJUNCTION

13

14

a Delaware Corporation, 15

SAFENAY INC...

Defendant

16 17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

Plaintiff, the People of the State of California ("the People'), appearing through its attorneys, Gary Lieberstein, District Attorney for the County of Napa, by Daryl Roberts, Deputy District Attorney; Blizabeth Egan, District Attorney for the County of Fresno, by Roger Wilson, Deputy District Attorney; Edward S. Berberian, Jr., District Attorney for the County of Marin, by Robert R. Michols, Deputy District Attorney; Jan Scully, District Attorney of the County of Sacramanto, by Ruth Young, Deputy District Attorney; Bob Lee, District Attorney for the County of Santa Cruz, by William Atkingon, Deputy District Attorney, David W. Paulson, District Attorney for the County of Solano, by Dani Jo

28 7ECEVED

JJN 052004

Handell, Deputy District Attorney, and Defendant Safeway Inc.,

FINAL JUDGISHOF AND PRIMARRY INJUNCTION

nazil dipetior (REST

4 ₁

Delaware Corporation, appearing through its attorneys, Latham & Watkins, LLP, by Stephen Stublarec, Esquire.

Plaintiff and Defendant, having stipulated to the entry of this Final Judgment and Permanent Injunction Pursuant to Stipulation ("Final Judgment") prior to the taking of any proof, and without trial or adjudication of any issue of fact or law; NOW, THEREFORE, THE COURT ORDERS THAT:

JURISDICTION

 This action is brought under California law, and this Court has jurisdiction of the subject matter and the parties;

APPLICABILITY

2. To the extent permitted by law, this Final Judgment is applicable to Safeway Inc., a Delaware corporation, its officers, directors, representatives, successors, assigness, and all persons, partnerships, corporations, and other entities acting under, by, through, on behalf of, or in concert with Safeway Inc., with actual or constructive notice knowledge of this Judgment. This Final Judgment is also applicable to any and all subsidiaries of Safeway Inc., including but not limited to The Vons Companies, Inc., and their respective officers, directors, representatives, successors, assigness and all persons, partnerships, corporations, and other ectities acting under, by through, on behalf of, or in concert with any such subsidiary with actual or constructive knowledge of this Final Judgment. All of these defendants, persons and entities shall hereinafter be referred to as "Safeway".

INJUNCTION

STORE CONSTRUCTION, REMODELING, REPAIR AND ALTERATION

Pursuant to Business and Professions Code \$17203, Safeway.

is permanently enjoined and restrained, with respect to any and all California Sefeway and Vons stores ("all California stores"), from doing, directly or indirectly, any of the following:

- A. Building, remodeling or altering any aspect of an individual store's structure or infrastructure, internal and/or external (bereinafter, 'store construction project'), without first submitting all appropriate plans and obtaining all required approvals and/or permits in compliance with all city, county, state, and federal laws.
- B. Failing to abide by each and every provision of Health & Safety Code \$113984, relating to the protection of food from contemination.
- C. Pailing to abide by each and every provision of Health & Safety Code \$\$113953 and 113953.2, relating to the obligation to provide and maintain adequate hand washing facilities and supplies.
- D. Pailing to abide by each and every provision of Health & Safety Code \$113996, relating to maintaining temperatures of potentially hexardous foods.
- E. Failing to abide by each and every provision of Health & Bafety Code \$5114097, 114113 and 114115, relating to cleaning food and equipment contact surfaces.
- P. Pailing to abide by each and every provision of Health & Safety Cods \$114257, relating to the obligation to maintain facilities clean and in good repair.
- G. Pailing to abide by each and every provision of Health & Safety Code \$114266, relating to maintaining all floors, walls and overhead structures of a food facility in compliance

5

6 7

9

8

10 11

12 13

14 15

17

18 19

20 21

22 23

24 25

26

27

28

- H. Failing to abide by each and every provision of Health & Safety Code \$114268, relating to properly maintaining floors.
- I. Failing to abide by each and every provision of Realth & Safety Code \$114271, relating to properly maintaining walls and cailings.
- J. Failing to abide by each and every provision of Health & Safety Code \$114380, relating to obtaining and submitting approved plans before remodeling a food facility.
- Failing to abide by each and every provision of Health & Safety Code #114381, prohibiting a food facility without a valid parmit from being open for business.
- Pailing to abide by each and every provision of Realth & Safety Code \$114130, prohibiting the use of food-related or utensil-related equipment that is not certified by the American National Standards Institute.
- Pursuant to Business and Professions Code \$17203, Safeway is ordered and mandated forthwith to maintain, electronically or at the then current location of either the Corporate Construction Department or Division Office, documentation for each store construction project establishing that all required permits. authorizations and approvals were obtained. Upon reasonable notice, Safeway shall deliver or make available such documentation for inspection or copying by the appropriate governmental officials. The Corporate Construction Department is currently located at 4410 Rosewood Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588. The Division office for stores in the Northern California Division is currently located at

В

6000 Stoneridge Mall Road, Pleasanton, CA 94588, and the Division office for stores in the Vons Division is currently located at 618 Michillinde Avenue, Arcadia, CA 91007. In the event any of these addresses change, Safeway shall promptly notify representatives of the People of the new address.

- 5. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code \$17203, Safeway shall:
- A. Prior to any store construction project taking place, appoint a Site Construction Director ("SCD") and an Alternate Site Construction Director ("Alternate SCD") for avery location where a store construction project is proposed to take place. The SCD and Alternate SCD may be the store manager and/or other designated individuals.
- B. Saleway shall develop a SCD manual describing the various approvals, authorizations and permits necessary to comply with all applicable laws required for a store construction project. The manual shall also inform the SCD and Alternate SCD that he/she will be responsible for assuring compliance with all plans and permit conditions, authorizations and approvals. This manual shall be updated on an annual basis.
- C. Safeway shall develop a "checklist" of all parmits, approvals and authorizations necessary to comply with all applicable laws required for a store construction project, which shall be placed in the SCD manual. This checklist shall be updated on an annual basis.
- p. Prior to commencement by Safeway or any affiliate of any store construction project, the SCD or Alternate SCD shall review the checklist and assure that all required permits,

1	authorisations, and approvals have been obtained. The SCD or	
2	alternate SCD shall note on the checklist next to each item on the	
3	list, either: "Permit, Authorization or Approval Obtained" or "Not	
4	Applicable. When all items on the checklist have been addressed,	
5	the SCD or alternate SCD shall sign and date the checklist, and	
6	shall preserve the checklist as part of the documentation required	
7	by Paragraph 4, above.	
В	8. The SCD or the Alternate SCD shall review all	
9	permits, authorizations and approvals and create a document	
10	entitled, "Construction Permit Conditions," which document shall	
11	list all conditions and requirements imposed for any store	
12	construction project, and shall include but not be limited to:	
13	(1) A description of the construction to be	
14	performed;	
15	(2) Times when construction may be performed;	
16	(3) Locations where construction will be	
17	performed;	
18	(4) Protective measures required such as	
19	temporary walls, closure of areas, closure of departments,	
20	protection of food or products from contamination or adulteration;	
21	and,	
22	(5) Rodent and vermin control.	
23	F. No store construction project shall commence or	
24 [continue unless a signed and dated checklist has been completed and	
25	a Construction Permit Conditions document has been created.	
36	 The SCD or Alternative SCD shall monitor all 	
27	construction activity at the store construction project and assure	

The SCD or

Ð 9

10

11 12

13

14

15 16

18 19

17

20 21

22 23

24 25

26

27

all conditions set forth on the Construction Permit Conditions document.

In the event the SCD or Alternate SCD learns that construction at a store construction project is proceeding in violation of any construction permit condition, the SCO or Alternate SCD shall stop all construction activity that is in violation of any construction permit condition, and promptly take steps to resady the violation.

PRICING AND MEIGHING ACCURACY

- Pursuant to Business and Professions Code \$517203 and 17535, Safeway is permanently enjoined and restrained from directly and indirectly engaging in any of the following acts or practices in all California stores:
- Making or causing to be made any false or misleading statement to the public with respect to the price of items offered for sale, as prohibited by Business and Professions Code \$17500.
- Representing a price on an item, store shelf or sign near the item and charging a greater price at the time the product is purchased;
- Charging's greater amount than the lowest C. advertised, posted, marked or quoted price for that commodity, as prohibited by Business and Professions Code \$12024.2;
- Computing at the time of sale an amount greater than a true extension of a price per unit, that is then advertised, posted, marked, displayed, or quoted for that commodity, in violation of Business and Professions Code \$12024.2;
- Selling any commodity, according to gross weight or 28 | measure, as prohibited by Business and Professions Code \$12023;

1¢

- F. Selling any commodity in less quantity than represented, as prohibited by Business and Professions Code 512024; and.
- G. Violating any of the provisions of Business & Professions Code \$12024.5.
- 7. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code 5\$17203 and 17535, Safeway shall initiate and maintain a program to minimize pricing discrepancies, which shall include at least all of the following:
- A. Safeway shall employ a Price Accuracy Coordinator ("PAC") at each store, who shall conduct the pricing accuracy inspections and audits required by subparagraph 7(8) of this Final Judgment. Safeway shall employ at least one employee in each store who is specially trained to perform the PAC's job. Each store shall have a minimum of 40 hours per week allocated to the duties of the PAC.
- 8. Starting no later than 50 days after the entry of this Pinal Judgment, and continuing thereafter, the PAC shall conduct price accuracy inspections/audits of the store to monitor the accuracy of pricing and the removal of all expired sale and price tags. The PAC shall conduct price accuracy inspections/ audits of no less than 500 items per week. Safeway shall maintain records of such inspections/audits at its corporate headquarters for a period of two years from the date of creation, and shall make said records available for inspection and copying to any Peace Officer, District Attorney, City Attorney, any authorized representative of the State of California Division of Measurement Standards, or any representative of the County Sealer or Director

11 12

13 14

15

16 17

18

19 20

21 22

23

24 25

26

27

of a County Agricultural Commissioner at a reasonable time and place upon responable notice.

- C. If there is a discrepancy between an advartised price (an advertisement, display sign, shelf price tag, label or any other expression of price) on the one hand and the scan price on the other hand, which discrepancy can be corrected at the store, Safeway shall be restoneible for instituting corrective action no later than four (4) hours after discovery of such discrepancy. If there is a discrepancy requiring action by Safaway corporate beadquarters, Safeway shall institute corrective action within eighteen (18) hours after a datermination that the discrepancy has resulted from a system problem. Safeway corporate beadquarters shall create a log of errors and corrective actions, which shall be maintained for a period of two years after their creation. shall make these records available for inepection and copying to any Peace Officer, District Attorney, City Attorney, any authorized representative of the State of California Division of Neasurement Standards, or any representative of the County Sealer or Director of a County Agricultural Commissioner at a reasonable time and place upon reasonable ndrice.
- Safeway shall cause to be conducted at least one price accuracy inspection in all Californie stores in every six menth calendar period following the entry of this Final Judgment. Such inspections shall include 200 scan checks per store, and shall be conducted in an average of 75 stores every month. In the event inspections reveal a discrepancy, corrective action shall be taken as described in Paragraph 7.C of this Pinal Judgment. shall maintain records of the performance of such inspections at

its corporate headquarters for a period of two years from the date of their creation. Safeway shall make the records available for inspection and copying to any Peace Officer, District Attorney, City Attorney, any authorized representative of the State of California Division of Measurement Standards, or any representative of the County Sealer or Director of a County Agricultural Commissioner at a reasonable time and place upon reasonable notice.

- B. By no later than 90 days after entry of this Pinal Judgment, Safeway shall post at a conspicuous location in all checkout lanes in all California stores, a clear and legible sign, no smaller than 7" x 4", which states, in substance, that if an item soams at the register at a higher price than the lowest advertised price, Safeway shall give the customer the item free, subject to a limit of one (other items at the lower price) and excluding dairy products, alcoholic beverages, tobacco products, pharmacy products and fuel, provided, however, that if the lowest advertised price of the item exceeds \$5.00, then Safeway shall sell the item to the customer at the lowest advertised price and give the customer a \$5.00 gift card. As used in this Paragraph 7.8 "lowest advertised price" means the current, non-retracted advertised price for the item for the store at which the item is scanned.
- 8. Safeway shall institute the following procedures and practices with respect to weighing accuracy in all California stores:
- A. Once per day, personnel in each store shall randomly select five items in each of the meat, deli and bakery departments whose weights and tares shall be verified and noted in a tare log.

Bach store shall maintain its tare log for a calendar year from the date of creation. Tare logs shall be inspected quarterly by a field marchandiser and audited semi-annually by Safeway. Safeway shall make these tare logs available to any Feace Officer, District Attorney, City Attorney, any authorized representative of the State of California Division of Measurement Standards, for any representative of the County Sealer or Director of a County Agricultural Commissioner at a reasonable time and place upon reasonable notice.

B. Sefeway shall cause to be conducted inspections of package net weights in all California stores in every six month

Б

ŹĎ

- package net weights in all California stores in every six month calendar period following the entry of this injunction. The inspections shall include 50 net weight checks, and shall be conducted in an average of 75 stores every month. In the event inspections reveal a discrepancy, corrective action shall be taken as described in Paragraph 7.C of this Final Judgment. Safeway shall maintain records of the performance of such inspections at its corporate headquarters for a period of two years from the date of their creation. Safeway shall make the records available for inspection and copying to any Peace Officer, District Attorney, City Attorney, any authorized representative of the State of California Division of Measurement Standards, or any representative of the County Sealer or Director of a County Agricultural Commissioner at a reasonable time and place upon reasonable notice.
- 9. Notwithstanding any provision of this Final Judgment to the contrary, any records that Safeway is required by Paragraph ? or 8 to create, maintain and make available for inspection and copying by any Peace Officer, District Attorney, City Attorney, any

authorized representative of the State of California Division of Measurement Standards, or any representative of the County Sealer or Director of a County Agricultural Commissioner, shall not be offered or received in evidence to show any alleged violation of any law or regulation, provided, however, that such records may be offered only as evidence of Safeway's performance or non-performance of the inspections or audits required by Paragraphs 7 and 8 of this Final Judgment. The disclosure of such records by Safeway shall not constitute, or be asserted or considered to be, a waiver of any privilege, including the attorney-client privilege and the attorney work product rule that might otherwise apply.

10. Nothing in this Final Judgment shall in any way prevent Safeway from developing, testing or implementing new or different systems or measures regarding the subjects covered by this Final Judgment. At Safeway's request, upon implementation or proposed implementation of any such new or different system or measure, the parties agree to meet and confer regarding the viability or continued application of any particular affected provision of this Final Judgment.

11. If there have been no meterial violations of the injunctive provision of this Final Judgment within five years from the data of its entry, Safeway may make, and the People shall not oppose, a motion to modify this Final Judgment by vacating Paragraphs 5,7, and 6. Nothing in this Paragraph shall in any way limit Safeway's right to seek modification or dissolution of the injunction pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure \$533. Except as otherwise stated in the first sentence of this Paragraph nothing shall in any way limit the People's right to oppose such an

application.

2

3

ė.

5

MONETARY RELIEF

12. Safeway shall pay the People as and for investigative costs the sum of \$389,551.57 by one cartified check made payment to the "Marin County District Attorney." Said costs shall be distributed to the agencies listed below in the following amounts:

7	- AGENCY	Amount
8	California Division of Measurement Standards Amador County Department of WAM	\$ 22,310.98 \$ 132.06
9	Contro Costa County Department of WAM - Del Norte County Department of WAM	\$ 5,180.00 \$ 167.06
10	El Dorado County Department of WAN	\$ 856.07
11	Freeno County Department of WAM Imperial County Department of WAM	\$ 867.91 \$ 2,857.31
12	Los Angeles County District Attorney	\$ 522.80 \$ 100,000.00
13	Los Azgales County Department of W&M Marin County Department of W&K	\$ 23,240.50 \$ 9,438.95
14	Marin County Environmental Health Dapt. Monterey County Department of NEM	\$ 13,669.00 \$ 580.34
15	Napa County Department of Wam Napa County Environmental Health Dapt.	\$ 5,742.00 \$ 9,000.00
16	Orange County Department of W&M Placer County Department of W&M	\$ 1,764.00 \$ 350.00
í7	Riverside County Department of WEM Secremento Building Department	\$ 3,437.50 \$ 1,600.00
18	Sacramento County Department of WEM Sacramento Environmental Management Dept.	\$ 4,635.00
19	San Benito County Department of WAM	\$ 6,258.00 \$ 1,232.48
	San Bernardino County Department of WaM San Diego County Department of WaM	5 3,635.89 \$ 6,002.14
20	San Francisco County Department of WAM Santa Barbara County Department of WAM	\$ 560.00 \$ 3,750.00
21	Santa Clara County Department of WAM Santa Cruz County Department of WAM	\$ 24,910.75 \$ 6,240.00
32	Shasta County Department of Wam Solano County Department of Wam	\$ 2,780.17 \$ 5,398.60
23	Solano County District Attorney Solano County Environmental Health Dept	\$ 100,000.00 \$ 3,200.00
24	Sonoma County Department of WAM Stanislaus County Department of WAM	\$ 2,210.00 \$ 683.75
25	Tulare County Department of Wam Tulare County District Attorney	\$ 132.06 \$ 180.00 \$ 167.06 \$ 856.07 \$ 857.31 \$ 2,357.31 \$ 122.80 \$ 100.000.00 \$ 23,240.50 \$ 9,438.95 \$ 13,669.00 \$ 9,438.95 \$ 13,669.00 \$ 1,764.00 \$ 9,000.00 \$ 1,764.00 \$ 3,637.50 \$ 1,600.00 \$ 1,232.48 \$ 1,635.84 \$ 1,232.48 \$ 1,232
26	Venture County Department of NAM	\$ 6,072.00
27	Total Costs	\$ 389,551.57

RESTITUTION

1

Z

3

4

5

6 7

9

10 11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19 20

21

22

23

24

25 26

27

13. Recognizing the infeasibility of identifying injured consumers who suffered actual loss, the impracticality of providing direct restitution to said consumers, and the disproportionate costs of making restitution to individual consumers, which would far exceed the benefit consumers would gain, the parties agree that Safaway shall pay, pursuant to Business and Professions Code \$217203 and 17535, cy pres restitution in the sum of 6200,000.00. Said by pres restitution shall be divided aqually between the California Agriculture Commissioner and Sealer's Association Quality Control Trust Fund established pursuant to the Judgment in the case of People of the State of California v. Safeway Inc., et al, Sonoma County Superior Court case number 233008, filed July 7, 2003 and the Napa County Environmental Health Department Enforcement Trust fund to assist in the affective local investigation and prosecution of Health and Safety cases. The Court further orders that the monies paid to Napa County Environmental Health Department Enforcement Fund shall only be used for the purchase and ongoing operation of a new database tracking system for the Napa County Department of Environmental Management, which shall include an enforcement module and tracking systems for other Department regulatory compliance programs. The payment required under this paragraph shall be made by one certified check payable to the "Marin District Attorney's Trust Account" for distribution to the representative Trust Funds.

Civil Penalties

14. Safeway is hereby ordered, pursuant to Business & Professions Code \$\$17206 and 17536, to pay at the time of the filling of this judgment, a civil penalty of Two Million. Two Hundred Thousand
Dollars \$2,200,000.00 by one certified check made payable to the
"Marin County District Attorney" Pursuant to Government Code
Section 26506 said civil penalty shall be divided and paid to the
prosecuting agencies bringing this action as follows:

Fresno County District Attorney 6400,000.00

Marin County District Attorney \$400,000.00

Napa County District Attorney \$300,000.00

Sacramento County District Attorney \$400,000.00

Santa Cruz County District Attorney \$400.000.00

Solano County District Attorney \$300,000.00

б

Ð

10 i

28.

Payment Nethod

15. All checks required under the terms of this Final Judgment shall be delivered to Robert E. Nichols, Marin County District Attorney's Office, 3501 Civic Center Drive, Room 130, San Rafael, California 94903, within five business days of the sotry of this Final Judgment.

RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

- 16. Jurisdiction is retained for the purpose of enabling any party to this Final Judgment to apply to the Court at any time for such further orders and directions as may be necessary and appropriate for the construction or carrying out of this Final Judgment, for the modification or termination of any of its injunctive provisions, and for the enforcement of, compliance with, and punishment of violations of this Final Judgment.
- 17. Where notice to Plaintiff is required under any provision of this Final Judgment, Defendant will have satisfied its

1	obligation hereunder by mailing notice to Robert Michols, Deputy			
.2	District Attorney, County of Marin.			
3	18. The clerk is ordered to immediately enter this Judgment.			
4	FRANCISCA P. TISHER			
5	Dated: JUN - 9 2008 Judge of the Superior Court			
б	**- 3			
7				
8				
9				
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				
16				
17				
19				
20				
21	•			
22	·			
2.3				
24				
25				
26				
7				
28				
•	ام م			